

Measures of efficiency in health care: QALMs about QALYs?

[Effizienzmaße im Gesundheitswesen]

Michael Schlander

German Journal for Evidence and Quality in Health Care
[Zeitschrift für Evidenz, Fortbildung und Qualität im Gesundheitswesen, ZEFQ]

Author:

Prof. Dr. Michael Schlander

(a) Institute for Innovation & Valuation in Health Care (InnoVal^{HC});

(b) Universität Heidelberg, Medizinische Fakultät Mannheim (Institut für Public Health);

(c) Hochschule für Wirtschaft Ludwigshafen

Address for Correspondence

Institute for Innovation & Valuation in Health Care – InnoVal^{HC}

An der Ringkirche 4, D-65197 Wiesbaden

Tel. +49-(0)611-4080 789 10; Fax: +49-(0)611-4080 789 99

Mail: michael.schlander@innoval-hc.com

Appendix A

References

References

1. Mishan EJ. *Welfare Economics: Ten Introductory Essays*. New York, NY: Random House 1969.
2. Mishan EJ. *Cost- Benefit Analysis*. London: George Allen & Unwin 1971.
3. Boadway RW, Bruce N. *Welfare Economics*. New York: Basil Blackwell 1984.
4. Gans O, Marggraf R. *Kosten-Nutzen-Analyse und ökonomische Politikbewertung 1: Wohlfahrtsmessung und betriebswirtschaftliche Investitionskriterien*. Berlin, Heidelberg, New York: Springer 1997.
5. Pauly MV. Foreword. In: Hammer PJ, Haas-Wilson D, Peterson MA, Sage WM (Editors): *Uncertain Times: Kenneth Arrow and the Changing Economics of Health Care*. Durham, London: Duke University Press 2003.
6. Brent RJ. *Cost-Benefit Analysis and Health Care Evaluations*. Cheltenham, Edward Elgar 2003.
7. Ng Y-K. *Welfare Economics: Towards a More Complete Analysis*. Houndmills and New York: Palgrave Macmillan 2004.
8. Zweifel P, Breyer F, Kifmann M. *Health Economics*. New York: Springer 2009 (2nd ed).
9. Hennisman P. *Welfare Economics and The Theory of Economic Policy*. Aldershot: Edward Elgar 1995.
10. Vickers D. *Economics and Ethics: An Introduction to Theory, Institutions, and Policy*. Westport, CT, Praeger 1997.
11. Ackerman F, Heinzerling L. *Priceless. On Knowing the Price of Everything and the Value of Nothing*. New York: The New Press 2004.
12. Dupuit J. De la Mesure de l'Utilité des Travaux Publiques. *Annales des Ponts et Chaussees* 1844; 2: 8. Reprint (in English): On the measurement of the utility of public works. *International Economic Papers* 1952; 2: 83-110.
13. Bentham J. An introduction to the principles of morals and legislation. In: Mill JS, Bentham J (Editors) *Utilitarianism and Other Essays*. Harmondsworth: Penguin 1824/1987.
14. Edgeworth FY. The hedonic calculus. *Mind* 1879; 4: 394-408.
15. Sugden R. Rational choice: a survey of contributions from economics and philosophy. *Economic Journal* 1991; 101: 751-785.
16. Stigler G. The development of utility theory I. *Journal of Political Economy* 1950; 58: 307-327.

17. Georgescu-Roegen N. Utility. In: Sills DL (Editor) *International Encyclopedia of the Social Sciences*. New York: Scribners 1968.
18. Samuelson PA. Social indifference curves. *The Quarterly Journal of Economics* 1956; 70 (1): 1-22.
19. Schreyoegg J, Stargardt T, Velasco-Garrido, Busse R. Defining the "Health Benefit Basket" in nine European countries. Evidence from the European Union Health BASKET Project. *European Journal of Health Economics* 2005; 6 (Suppl 1): 2-10.
20. Schlander M: *Health economic evaluation of medical interventions: answering questions people are unwilling to ask?* 5th World Congress, International Health Economics Association (iHEA), Barcelona, July 13, 2005: Book of Abstracts 354-355.
21. Schlander M. Kosteneffektivität und Ressourcenallokation: Gibt es einen normativen Anspruch der Gesundheitsökonomie? In: Kick HA, Taupitz J (Editors) *Gesundheitswesen zwischen Wirtschaftlichkeit und Menschlichkeit*. Muenster, LIT-Verlag 2005: 37-112.
22. Richardson J, McKie J. Economic evaluation of services for a national health scheme: the case for a fairness-based framework. *Journal of Health Economics* 2007; 26 (4): 785-799.
23. Sen AK. Interpersonal aggregation and partial comparability. *Econometrica* 1970; 38: 393-409.
24. Kahneman D, Wakker PP, Sarin R. Back to Bentham? Explorations of experienced utility. *The Quarterly Journal of Economics* 1997; 112: 375-405.
25. Olsen JA, Smith RD. Theory versus practice: a review of 'willingness-to-pay' in health and health care. *Health Economics* 2001; 10: 39-52.
26. Gold MR, Siegel JE, Russell LB, Weinstein MC. *Cost-effectiveness in health and medicine*. New York, NY, Oxford University Press 1996.
27. Bateman IJ, Carson RT, Day B, Hanemann M, Hanley N, Hett T, et al. *Economic Valuation with Stated Preference Techniques: A Manual*. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar 2002.
28. Culyer AJ. Merit goods and the welfare economics of coercion. *Public Finance* 1971; 26: 546-572.
29. Culyer AJ. The normative economics of health care finance and provision. *Oxford Review of Economic Policy* 1989; 5 (1): 34-56.
30. Brouwer WBF, Culyer AJ, van Exel NJA, Rutten FFH. Welfarism vs. extra-welfarism. *Journal of Health Economics* 2008; 27: 325-338.

31. Sugden R, Williams A. *The Principles of Practical Cost-Benefit Analysis*. Oxford: Oxford University Press 1978.
32. Johannesson M, O'Connor RM. Cost-utility analysis from a societal perspective. *Health Policy* 1997; 39 (3): 241-253.
33. Hjelmgren J, Bergren F, Andersson F. Health economic guidelines – similarities, differences and some implications. *Value in Health* 2001; 4 (3): 225-250.
34. National Institute for Clinical Excellence (NICE). *Guide to the methods of technology appraisal*. London, NICE 2004.
35. Schlander M. Reference case. In: Kattan M, Cowen ME Eds. *Encyclopedia of medical decision making*. Thousand Oaks, Sage 2009.
36. Sen AK. *Collective Choice and Social Welfare*. San Francisco: Holden-Day 1970.
37. Sen AK. *Commodities and Capabilities*. Amsterdam, North Holland 1985.
38. Sen AK. *On Ethics and Economics*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers 1987.
39. Sen AK. Capability and well-being. In: Nussbaum MC, Sen AK (editors) *The Quality of Life*. Oxford: Clarendon Press 1993: 31-53.
40. Sugden R. Welfare, resources, and capabilities: a review of inequality re-examined by Amartya Sen. *Journal of Economic Literature* 1993; 31: 1947-1962.
41. Black WC. The cost-effectiveness plane: a graphic representation of cost-effectiveness. *Medical Decision Making* 1990; 10: 212-215.
42. Gold MR, Stevenson D, Fryback DG. HALYs and QALYs and DALYs, oh my: similarities and differences in summary measures of population health. *Annual Review of Public Health* 2002; 23: 115-134.
43. Drummond MF, Sculpher MJ, Torrance GW, O'Brien BJ, Stoddart GL. *Methods for the Economic Evaluation of Health Care Programmes*. Oxford: Oxford University Press 2005 (3rd ed).
44. Schlander M. In search of efficiency. [in German: Der Effizienz auf der Spur]. *Zeitschrift für Evidenz Fortbildung und Qualität im Gesundheitswesen (ZEFQ) [German Journal for Evidence and Quality in Health Care]* 2009; 103: 117-125.
45. Bleichrodt H, Pinto JL. Conceptual foundations for health utility measurement. In: Jones AM Ed, *The Elgar Companion to Health Economics*. Cheltenham, Edward Elgar 2006; 347-358.

46. Brazier J, Ratcliffe J, Salomon JA, Tsuchiya A. *Measuring and Valuing Health Benefits for Economic Evaluation*. Oxford: Oxford University Press 2007.
47. Smith RD, Richardson J. Can we estimate the 'social' value of a QALY? Four core issues to resolve. *Health Policy* 2005; 74 (1): 77-84.
48. Weinstein MC, Zeckhauser RJ. Critical ratios and efficient allocation. *Journal of Public Economics* 1972; 2 (2): 147-157.
49. Weinstein MC, Stason WB. Foundations of cost-effectiveness analysis for health and medical practices. *New England Journal of Medicine* 1977; 296 (13): 716-721.
50. Rawlins MD, Culyer AJ. National Institute of Clinical Excellence and its value judgments. *British Medical Journal* 2004; 329: 224-227.
51. Dolan P, Tsuchiya A. The elicitation of distributional judgements in the context of economic evaluation. In: Jones AM Ed, *The Elgar Companion to Health Economics*. Cheltenham, Edward Elgar 2006; 382-391.
52. Culyer AJ. The rationing debate: Maximising the health of the whole community. The case for. *British Medical Journal* 1997; 314: 667-669.
53. Briggs AH, O'Brien BJ. The death of cost minimisation analysis? *Health Economics* 2001; 10: 179-184.
54. Gafni A, Birch S. Incremental cost-effectiveness ratios (ICERs): the silence of the lambda. *Social Science & Medicine* 2006; 62: 2091-2100.
55. Mehrez A, Gafni A. Quality-adjusted life years, utility-theory, and healthy-years equivalents. *Medical Decision Making* 1989; 9: 142-149.
56. Mehrez A, Gafni A. The healthy-years equivalents – how to measure them using the standard gamble approach. *Medical Decision Making* 1991; 11: 140-146.
57. Wakker P. A criticism of healthy years equivalents. *Medical Decision Making* 1996; 16: 207-214.
58. Gafni A, Birch S, Mehrez A. Economics, health and health economics – HYE's versus QALYs. *Journal of Health Economics* 1993; 12: 325-339.
59. Ried W. QALYs versus HYE's – what's right and what's wrong. A review of the controversy. *Journal of Health Economics* 1998; 17 (5): 607-625.
60. O'Connor AB, Noyes K, Holloway RG. A cost-effectiveness comparison of Desimipramine, gabapentin, and pregabalin for treating postherpetic neuralgia. *Journal of the American Geriatric Society* 2007; 55 (8): 1176-1184.

61. Meropol SB. Valuing reduced antibiotic use for pediatric acute otitis media. *Pediatrics* 2008; 121 (4): 669-673.
62. Láinez MJ. The effect of migraine prophylaxis on migraine-related resource use and productivity. *CNS Drugs* 2009; 23 (9): 727-738.
63. Stadler M, Schlander M, Braeckman M, Nguyen T, Boogaerts JG. A cost-utility and cost-effectiveness analysis of an acute pain service. *Journal of Clinical Anesthesia* 2004; 16: 159-167.
64. Neuner JM, Hamel MB, Phillips RS, Bona K, Aronson MD. Diagnosis and management of adults with pharyngitis. A cost-effectiveness analysis. *Annals of Internal Medicine* 2003; 139 (2): 113-122.
65. Neighbors DM, Bell TJ, Wilson J, Dodd SL. Economic evaluation of the Fentanyl transdermal system for the treatment of chronic moderate to severe pain. *Journal of Pain and Symptom Management* 2001; 21 (2): 129-143.
66. Greiner W, Lehmann K, Earnshaw S, Bug C, Sabatowski R. Economic evaluation of Durogesic in moderate to severe, non-malignant, chronic pain in Germany. *European Journal of Health Economics* 2006; 7 (4): 290-296.
67. Kneis KC, Gandjour A. Economic evaluation of Sinfrontal in the treatment of acute maxillary sinusitis in adults. *Applied Health Economics and Health Policy* 2009; 7 (3): 181-191.
68. McGregor M. What decision-makers want and what they have been getting. *Value in Health* 2006; 9 (3): 181-185
69. Dworkin R. *Taking rights seriously*. Cambridge, Harvard University Press 1977.
70. Richardson J, McKie J. Empiricism, ethics and orthodox economic theory: what is the appropriate basis for decision-making in the health sector? *Social Science & Medicine* 2005; 60: 265-275.
71. Dolan P, Shaw R, Tsuchiya A, Williams A. QALY maximisation and people's preferences: a methodological review of the literature. *Health Economics* 2005; 14 (2): 197-208.
72. Nord E, Richardson J, Street A, Kuhse H, Singer P. Who cares about cost? Does economic analysis impose or reflect social values? *Health Policy* 1995; 34 (2): 79-94.
73. Kahneman D. Evaluation by moments: past and future. In: Kahneman D, Tversky AS (Editors) *Choices, Values and Frames*. New York: Cambridge University Press and The Russell Sage Foundation 2000: 693-708.
74. Boyd NF, Sutherland HJ, Heasman ZK, Cummings BJ. Whose values for decision-making? *Medical Decision Making* 1990; 10: 58-67.

75. Richardson J. Cost utility analysis; what should be measured? *Social Science & Medicine* 1994; 39 (1): 7-21.
76. Menzel P, Dolan P, Richardson J, Olsen JA. The role of adaptation to disability and disease in health state valuation: a preliminary normative analysis. *Social Science & Medicine* 2002; 55: 2149-2158.
77. Berk ML, Monheit AC. The concentration of health expenditures: an update. *Health Affairs* 1992; 11 (4): 145-149.
78. Alemayehu B, Warner KE. The lifetime distribution of health care costs. *Health Services Research* 2004; 39 (3): 627-642.
79. Conwell LJ, Cohen JW. *Characteristics of people with high medical expenditures in the U.S. civilian noninstitutionalized population, 2002*. Statistical Brief No. 73. Rockville: Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality (AHRQ), March 2005.
80. Friedman B, Jiang HJ, Elixhauser A, Segal A. Hospital inpatient costs for adults with multiple chronic conditions. *Medical Care Research and Review (MCRR)* 2006; 63 (3): 327-346.
81. Brown MM, Brown GC, Sharma S. *Evidence-Based to Value-Based-Medicine*. American Medical Association (AMA) Press 2005.
82. Buxton M. Looking for a willingness-to-pay threshold for a QALY – does it make sense? A practical view. *ISPOR Connections* 2007; 13 (4): 9-11.
83. Harris RA, Nease RF jr. The importance of patient preferences for comorbidities in cost-effectiveness analyses. *Journal of Health Economics* 1997; 16: 113-119.
84. Luebke W. Economizing life and death. Available online at www.project-syndicate.org. Last accessed February 28, 2010.
85. Torrance GW. Utility measurement in healthcare: the things I never got to. *Pharmacoeconomics* 2006; 24 (11): 1069-1078.
86. Culyer AJ, Lavers RJ, Williams A. Social indicators: health. *Social Trends* 1971; 2: 31-42.
87. Schlander M, Richardson J. The evolving health economics evaluation paradigm and the role of the QALY. *Value in Health* 2009; 12 (7): A400.
88. Schlander M. The use of cost-effectiveness by the National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence (NICE): no(t yet an) exemplar of a deliberative process. *Journal of Medical Ethics* 2008; 34: 534-539.
89. Stolk EA, Busschbach JJ, Caffa M, Meuleman EJ, Rutten FF. Cost utility analysis of sildenafil compared with papaverine-phentolamine injections. *British Medical Journal* 2000; 320: 1165-1168.

90. Culyer AJ. Commodities, characteristics of commodities, characteristics of people, utilities, and the quality of life. In: Baldwin S (Editor) *Quality of Life: Perspectives and Policies*. London; Routledge 1990: 9-27.
91. Nussbaum MC. Capabilities as fundamental entitlements: Sen and social justice. *Feminist Economics* 2003; 9 (2-3): 33-59.
92. Coast J, Smith RD, Lorgelly P. Welfarism, extra-welfarism and capability: the spread of ideas in health economics. *Social Science & Medicine* 2008; 67: 1190-1198.
93. Rawls J. *A Theory of Justice*. Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1971; 1999.
94. Brock DW. Ethical issues in the use of cost effectiveness analysis for the prioritisation of health care resources. In: Anand S, Peter F, Sen A (Editors) *Public Health, Ethics, and Equity*. Oxford: Oxford University Press 2006: 201-223.
95. Schlander M. *Health Technology Assessments by the National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence. A Qualitative Study*. New York: Springer 2007.
96. Sorenson C, Drummond M, Kanavos P. *Ensuring Value for Money in Health Care. The Role of Health Technology Assessment in the European Union*. Copenhagen: WHO Regional Office for Europe 2008.
97. National Institute for Clinical Excellence (NICE). *Guide to the Technology Appraisal Process (reference N0514)*. London, NICE 2004.
98. Buxton M. Economic evaluation and decision making in the UK. *PharmacoEconomics* 2006; 24 (11): 1133-1142.
99. Culyer AJ, McCabe A, Briggs A, Claxton K, Buxton M, Akehurst R, et al. Searching for a threshold, not setting one: the role of the National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence. *Journal of Health Services Research & Policy* 2007; 12 (1): 56-58.
100. McCabe C, Claxton K, Culyer AJ. The NICE cost-effectiveness threshold: what it is and what it means. *PharmacoEconomics* 2008; 26 (9): 733-744.
101. Appleby J, Devlin N, Parkin D, Buxton M, Chalkidou K. Searching for cost effectiveness thresholds in the NHS. *Health Policy* 2009; 91 (3): 239-245.
102. Saul H. NICE: New criteria for end-of-life medicines. *European Journal of Cancer* 2009; 4.
103. Drummond MF, Wilson DA, Kanavos P, Ubel P, Rovira J. Assessing the economic challenges posed by orphan drugs. *International Journal of Technology Assessment in Health Care* 2007; 23 (1): 36-42.

104. Schlander M, Beck M. Expensive drugs for rare disorders: to treat or not to treat? The case of enzyme replacement therapy for mucopolysaccharidosis VI. *Current Medical Research and Opinion* 2009; 25 (5): 1285-1293.
105. Le Pen C. Is there a "continental" view of health economics evaluation? *European Journal of Health Economics* 2009; 10: 121-123.
106. De Pouvourville G. Pricing and reimbursement for drugs in France: what role for cost-effectiveness analysis? In Schlander M Ed. *Economic evaluation of health care programs: current concepts, controversies, and international experience*. New York, NY, Springer 2010 (*in press*).
107. Caro JJ, Kolominsky-Rabas P. The German approach: IQWiG. In Schlander M Ed. *Economic evaluation of health care programs: current concepts, controversies, and international experience*. New York, NY, Springer 2010 (*in press*).
108. Institut für Qualität und Wirtschaftlichkeit im Gesundheitswesen (IQWiG). *Allgemeine Methoden zur Bewertung von Verhältnissen zwischen Nutzen und Kosten. Version 1 vom 12.10.2009*. Cologne, IQWiG 2009. Available online at www.iqwig.de/index.736.html. Last accessed December 31, 2009.
109. Neumann PJ, Greenberg D. Is the United States ready for QALYs? *Health Affairs* 2009; 28 (5): 1366-1371.
110. Nord E. *Cost-Value Analysis in Health Care: Making Sense out of QALYs*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press 1999.
111. Adler MD, Posner EA. *New Foundations of Cost-Benefit Analysis*. Cambridge and London: Harvard University Press 2006.
112. Richardson J, Iezzi A, Sinha K, McKie J. *The Relative Social-Willingness to Pay Instrument: Justification and Initial Results*. Melbourne: Monash University, Centre for Health Economics, Research Paper 2007 (22), revised April 2008.
113. Mooney G. Communitarian claims and community capabilities: furthering priority setting? *Social Science & Medicine* 2005; 60 (2): 247-255.
114. Mooney G. *Challenging Health Economics*. Oxford: Oxford University Press 2009.